

# 2014 REPLAY CHANGE REQUESTS

---

The selection screen follows the comments. Although there are 13 replay change requests listed, there really are not many actual changes at all.

[1] Rule 12-3-3-c: Live ball not ruled dead in possession of a ball carrier. No change in rule but an attempt to apply Rule 4-1-3 as originally intended.

[2] Rule 12-3-3-c: Live ball not ruled dead in possession of a ball carrier. Actually, ball ruled dead when it should not have been ruled dead.

[3] Rule 12-3-1-a: A potential touchdown, *touchback* or safety. When indisputable video evidence shows that there would be a score except for an error by the official, replay should become involved.

[4] Rule 12-5-1-b-1: A coach should be permitted a challenge as long as he has been successful with all of his previous challenge(s).

---

1	REPLAY: Advance After Waving Signal (Case Play 113)	ir113	14
2	REPLAY: Official Signals Ball Dead (Case Play 113.A)	ir113A	14
3	REPLAY: Unsuccessful Field Goal Attempt (Case Play 113.B)	ir113B	14
4	REPLAY: Out of Bounds (Case Play 122)	ir122	14
5	REPLAY: Down By Rule (Case Play 122.A)	ir122A	14
6	REPLAY: Ball Carrier Simulates Knee Down (Case Play 122B)	ir122B	14
7	REPLAY: Ball Carrier's Helmet Off (Case Play 122.C)	ir122C	14
8	REPLAY: Live Ball Rule Dead (12-3-3-d)	1233d	14
9	REPLAY: Scoring Plays (12-3-1-a)	1231a	14
10	REPLAY: Possession of a Kick in the Field of Play (Case Play 110)	ir110	14
11	REPLAY: Illegal Forward Pass (Case Play 50)	ir50	14
12	REPLAY: Fumble at Goal Line (Case Play 125)	ir125	14
13	REPLAY: Coach's Challenge (12-5-1-b-1)	1251b1	14

---

# 2014 REPLAY CHANGE REQUEST

**REPLAY: ADVANCE AFTER WAVING SIGNAL (Case Play 113)**

---

**RULE NUMBER & PAGE: RULE 12-3-3-c, FR-107.**

**CASE PLAY 113, Case Book Page 37. Move prior to “Non-Reviewable Play Situations on Scrimmage Kicks”.**

## **INTERPRETATION CHANGE:**

**Rule 12-3-3-c (no change): Live ball ruled dead in possession of a ball carrier.**

**Case Play 113: Fourth and 7 on the A-35. B45 signals for a fair catch while the punt is in the air. B27, unaware of the signal by B45, catches the punt at the B-25 and returns it for a touchdown. No official signals the ball dead when caught.**

**RULING (current): Not reviewable. However, such an egregious error may be corrected. Delay of game, B 1-10 on B20, reset clock (Rule 12-3-6).**

**RULING (update): Reviewable. Ball should have been ruled dead when caught by B27 following a waving signal. NOTE: It is unlikely that the officials would penalize Team B for delay of game when they screwed up by not ruling the ball dead when caught or recovered.**

## **INTENT:**

**[1] Rule 12-3-3-c should cover instances where the ball becomes dead in Rule 4-1-3 except as otherwise ruled not reviewable. Rule 4-1-3-l is an example of a play that is generally not reviewable. Rule 4-1-3-g covers the above waving signal in Case Play 113.**

**[2] Other than a “runaway” clock, there have been no advertised plays where the “egregious” caper would have to be applied since the play is not otherwise covered by replay rules.**

**SOURCE: Rom Gilbert [1/11/14] ..... (rc14-ir113)(14)**

---

# 2014 REPLAY CHANGE REQUEST

**REPLAY: OFFICIAL SIGNALS BALL DEAD (Case Play 113.A)**

---

**RULE NUMBER & PAGE: RULE 12-3-3-c, FR-107.**

**CASE PLAY 113.A (new), Case Book Page 37.**

## **INTERPRETATION UPDATE:**

**Rule 12-3-3-c (no change): Live ball ruled dead in possession of a ball carrier.**

**Case Play 106.1 (new): Fourth and 7 on the A-35. A5's punt is rolling on B's 33 when the BJ gives a timeout signal. B44 picks up the ball and returns it for a touchdown. .**

**RULING: Reviewable. Ball should have been ruled dead when the BJ signaled time out. Rule 4-1-2-a has correctly stated for over 30 years that the ball becomes dead when an official otherwise signals the ball dead. NOTE: It would be Team B's ball at the location of the ball when the play was killed. If the crew owned up to the timeout signal and replay did not get involved, the play would be treated as an inadvertent whistle since the ball was still rolling. Once replay gets involved, inadvertent whistles are not one of the options.**

## **INTENT:**

[1] A team should not be allowed to score a touchdown with a dead ball. This play occurred in a conference championship game in 2012. Video showed that (a) some Team B players had left the field; and (b) an official had already retrieved a ball for the next play.

[2] The BJ did not own up to killing the play. It is not known why one of other officials did not do something if they knew that the BJ gave the timeout signal.

**SOURCE: Rom Gilbert [1/11/14] ..... (rc14-ir113A)(14)**

---

# 2014 REPLAY CHANGE REQUEST

**REPLAY: UNSUCCESSFUL FIELD GOAL ATTEMPT (Case Play 113.B)**

---

**RULE NUMBER & PAGE: RULE 12-3-3-c, FR-107.**

**CASE PLAY 113.B (new), Case Book Page 37.**

## **INTERPRETATION UPDATE:**

**Rule 12-3-3-c (no change): Live ball ruled dead in possession of a ball carrier.**

**Case Play 113.B (new): Fourth and goal on the B-8. A5's field goal attempt is blocked and lands in or rolls into Team B's end zone untouched by a player of Team B. B44 picks up the ball and returns it for a touchdown.**

**RULING: Reviewable. Ball should have been ruled dead when it hit the ground in B's end zone. Time will have to be put back on the clock unless the field goal attempt is a try.**

## **INTENT:**

**[1] A team should not be allowed to score a touchdown (6 or 2 points) with a dead ball. A Team B player advanced the ball 50 yards following a try during the 2012 season. Replay should get involved only if this Team B player had scored during the try down.**

**[2] It is not known why up to seven officials missed the call.**

**SOURCE: Rom Gilbert [1/11/14] ..... (rc14-ir113B)(14)**

---

# 2014 REPLAY CHANGE REQUEST

REPLAY: OUT OF BOUNDS (Case Play 122)

---

**RULE NUMBER & PAGE: RULE 12-3-3-g, FR-107.**

**CASE PLAY 122, Case Book Page 40.**

## INTERPRETATION CHANGE:

**Rule 12-3-3-g (no change):** Ball carrier in or out of bounds. If a ball carrier is ruled out of bounds, the play is not reviewable, except as in Rules 12-3-1-a and 12-3-3-d.

**Case Play 122:** Third and 5 on the B-35. Ball carrier A22 runs down the sideline and the Line Judge rules that he stepped out of bounds at the B-4 with his left foot. A22 then takes one more step and dives for the goal line and the ball breaks the plane within his possession before he lands in the end zone. Replay shows that A22 did not step out of bounds during his run.

**RULING (current):** Reviewable play. Reverse to touchdown. Adjust clock as necessary (Rule 123-3-1-a).

**RULING (update):** Reviewable play. Award the touchdown if there is no way that Team B could have prevented the touchdown. This could apply to any spot on the field but should apply close to the opponent's goal line.

## INTENT:

[1] This update was a previous interpretation. Not sure why it was changed to a step and a leap as opposed to two steps. It was previously, and with this change, is a common sense interpretation.

[2] If this play occurred as time expired in a high profile game and Team A was behind by less than nine points, it is likely that the current interpretation would be changed.

**SOURCE:** Rom Gilbert [1/11/14] ..... (rc14-ir122)(14)

---

# 2014 REPLAY CHANGE REQUEST

REPLAY: DOWN BY RULE (Case Play 122.A)

---

**RULE NUMBER & PAGE: RULE 12-3-3-c, FR-107.**

**CASE PLAY 122.A, Case Book Page 40.**

## INTERPRETATION CHANGE:

**Rule 12-3-3-c (no change): Live ball ruled dead in possession of a ball carrier.**

**Case Play 122: Third and 5 on the B-35. Ball carrier A22 takes a handoff and runs to the B-6 where he stumbles. He regains his balance and crosses Team B's goal line in possession of the ball. The Head Linesman rules that he was down at the B-25. Replay shows that A22 was not down.**

**RULING (current): Not reviewable. A 1-10 on B-25.**

**RULING (update): Reviewable. Award the touchdown if there is no way that Team B could have prevented the touchdown. This could apply to any spot on the field but should apply close to the opponent's goal line.**

## INTENT:

**[1] This update may have been a previous interpretation. It was, and remains, a common sense interpretation.**

**[2] If this play occurred as time expired in a high profile game and Team A was behind by less than nine points, it is likely that the current interpretation would be changed.**

**SOURCE: Rom Gilbert [1/11/13] ..... (rc14-ir122A)(14)**

---

# 2014 REPLAY CHANGE REQUEST

**REPLAY: BALL CARRIER SIMULATES KNEE DOWN (Case Play 122.B)**

---

**RULE NUMBER & PAGE: RULE 12-3-3-c, FR-107.**

**CASE PLAY 122.B, Case Book Page 40.**

## **INTERPRETATION CHANGE:**

**Rule 12-3-3-c (no change): Live ball ruled dead in possession of a ball carrier.**

**Case Play 122.B (new): Third and 5 on the A-35. The score is tied. A16 takes the snap and simulates placing his knee on the ground on A's 33. A16 rises and throws a completed pass to A22 who scores.**

**RULING (current): Unknown, but the play is probably not reviewable based on Case Play 113.**

**RULING (update): Reviewable. Fourth and 7 on the A-33.**

## **INTENT:**

[1] This should be considered a common sense interpretation. Rule 4-1-3-o indicates that the ball becomes dead when a ball carrier simulates placing his knee on the ground.

[2] If this play occurred as time expired in a high profile game with the score tied, it is likely that the probable current interpretation would be changed.

**SOURCE: Rom Gilbert [1/11/14] ..... (rc14-ir122B)(14)**

---

# 2014 REPLAY CHANGE REQUEST

**REPLAY: BALL CARRIER'S HELMET OFF (Case Play 122.C)**

---

**RULE NUMBER & PAGE: RULE 12-3-3-c, FR-107.**

**CASE PLAY 122.C, Case Book Page 40.**

## **INTERPRETATION CHANGE:**

**Rule 12-3-3-c (no change): Live ball ruled dead in possession of a ball carrier.**

**Case Play 122.C (new): Third and 5 on the B-35. Ball carrier A22 takes a handoff and runs to the B-4 where B-96 twists his facemask such that the helmet comes off. A22 maintains his balance and crosses B's goal line in possession of the ball. The Head Linesman rules the ball dead on B's 4. Replay shows that A22 was not down.**

**RULING (current): Probably not reviewable based on statement at Replay Clinic. A 1-goal on B-2.**

**RULING (update): Reviewable. Award the touchdown if there is no way that the defense could have prevented the touchdown. This could apply to any spot on the field but should apply close to the opponent's goal line.**

## **INTENT:**

**[1] This should be considered a common sense interpretation. Rule 4-1-3-q indicates that the ball becomes dead when a ball carrier's helmet comes completely off.**

**[2] If this play occurred as time expired in a high profile game and the scoring team was behind by less than nine points, it is likely that the probable current interpretation would be changed.**

**SOURCE: Rom Gilbert [1/11/14] ..... (rc14-ir122C)(14)**

---



# 2014 REPLAY CHANGE REQUEST

REPLAY: LIVE BALL RULED DEAD (Rule 12-3-3-d)

---

**RULE NUMBER & PAGE: RULE 12-3-3-d, FR-107.**

**CASE PLAY 129, Case Book Page 42.;**

## **RULE CHANGE:**

**Rule 12-3-3-d: Reviewable plays involving potential dead balls and loose balls include:**

**d. Loose ball ruled dead, or live ball ruled dead in possession of a ball carrier when the clear recovery of a loose ball occurs in the immediate continuing action. ...**

**Case Play 129: Team A snaps the ball at its 5-yard line. A12 throws a quick pass to the flat receiver A44. The head linesman signals incomplete pass as the ball hits the ground, takes a backward bounce and rolls into the end zone and out of bounds.**

**RULING: While a forward-backward pass is reviewable only if there is a clear recovery in the immediate continuing *action* (Rule 12-3-2-e), this play is reviewable because of the potential safety (12-3-1-a). COMMENT: Add a note to ruling that there is a potential touchback if the ball rolls out of bounds in the opponent's end zone.**

**RECOMMENDATION: Modify Rule 12-3-3-d or add Case Book plays to cover loose balls that become dead in either end zone without player possession.**

## **INTENT:**

**A fumble in the field of play might immediately go out of bounds in an end zone including hitting the goal line pylon. Case Book plays would serve a useful purpose when the loose ball goes out of bounds in the ball carrier's end zone (safety) or in his opponent's end zone (touchback). This assumes that no new impetus is added.**

**SOURCE: Rom Gilbert [1/11/14] ..... (1233d)(14)**

---

# 2014 REPLAY CHANGE REQUEST

## REPLAY: SCORING PLAYS (Rule 12-3-1-a)

---

**RULE NUMBER & PAGE: RULE 12-3-1-a, FR-106. Case Book Play 6.**

### **RULE CHANGE:**

**12-3-1-a (Update):** A potential touchdown, touchback or safety whether the result of the play or an accepted penalty.

### **INTENT:**

**Touchdowns, touchbacks and safeties all have a direct competitive impact of the game. Some, but not all, plays are covered by Rule 12-3-1-a.**

**[a]** The result of a play may be a safety, touchback or possibly momentum.

**[b]** The enforcement of penalties could result in a safety (or not a safety) when the spot of the foul, as evidenced by the spot of the flag, is in an end zone and said spot is an enforcement spot.

**[c]** An officiating error could result in a safety as the result of an accepted penalty for a foul after a change of team possession on a try or during extra periods. Penalties for live ball fouls after a change of team possession on a try or in extra periods are declined by rule with exceptions.

**[d]** Impetus is also a consideration in the result of the play being a safety or touchback.

**This suggested rule change has nothing to do with the spot of the foul which is currently not reviewable.**

**SOURCE:** Rom Gilbert [1/11/14] ..... (1231a)(14)

---

# 2014 REPLAY CHANGE REQUEST

REPLAY: POSSESSION OF KICK IN FIELD OF PLAY (Case Play 110)

---

**RULE NUMBER & PAGE: RULE 12-3-3-e, FR-107.**

**CASE PLAY 110, Casebook Page 37.**

## INTERPRETATION UPDATE:

**Rule 12-3-3-e (no change):** Reviewable plays involving potential dead balls and loose balls include: e. Live ball ruled dead in possession of a ball carrier.

**Case Play 110:** During a free kick, B22 leaps high into the air to catch a pooch kick in the middle of the field. He possesses the ball while airborne, lands at the B-40, and the ball comes loose after he has gone to the ground and is down. At the B-42, A30 clearly recovers the loose ball immediately. Officials incorrectly award possession to Team A.

**RULING (current):** Not reviewable. Team A's ball, first and 10 at the B-42. Touching of a kick is reviewable but recovery and possession is not.

**RULING (update):** Reviewable. Team B's ball, first and 10, at the B-40. The down ended when B22 was on the ground and down.

## INTENT:

[1] As the play is written, B22 is a ball carrier when he has possession of the ball and goes to the ground and is down.

[2] This play is compared to Play #107 by some officials. In Play #107, the punt was not muffed. If B22 was not down, then it would be a fumble. If B22 was down, the down ends.

**SOURCE:** Rom Gilbert [1/11/14] ..... (ir110)(14)

---

# 2014 REPLAY CHANGE REQUEST

## REPLAY: ILLEGAL FORWARD PASS (Case Play 50)

---

**RULE NUMBER & PAGE: RULE 12-3-2-e, FR-107.**

**CASE PLAY 50, Casebook Page 23.**

### INTERPRETATION CHANGE:

**Rule 12-3-2-e (no change):** Pass ruled forward or backward when thrown from behind the neutral zone.

**Rule 12-3-2-e-3 (add):** A second forward pass thrown during the down.

**Case Play 50:** First and 10 on the A-20. A10 throws a forward pass from the A-18 to back A22 at the A-19. A22 immediately throws a pass down field to A80, who catches it and runs for a touchdown. There are no flags on the play and the touchdown is allowed.

**RULING (no change):** Reviewable play, regarding A10's pass being forward or backward. Reverse to illegal forward pass A 2-16 on A14 (Rule 12-3-2-e).

**NOTE (Added):** Rule 12-3-2-e-3 should apply to all passes during the down.

### INTENT:

[1] Rules 12-3-2-d covers a forward pass or forward handing after a change of team possession. Rule 12-3-2-c covers a forward pass or forward handing when a ball carrier is or has been beyond the neutral zone. These two rules cover all illegal forward passes that carry a five yard penalty and loss of down except for two forward passes during the down (7-3-2-d).

[2] Some conferences, who have the financial means, use active officials on the sideline who have communication with replay officials to correct disasters. Games without active officials on sideline should allow replay to correct errors involving two forward passes during the down. Case Play 50 could be updated.

**SOURCE:** Rom Gilbert [1/11/14] ..... (ir50)(14)

---

# 2014 REPLAY CHANGE REQUEST

## REPLAY: FUMBLE AT GOAL LINE (Case Play 125)

---

**RULE NUMBER & PAGE: RULE 12-3-1-a, FR-106.**

**CASE PLAY 125, Casebook Page 41.**

### INTERPRETATION CHANGE:

**Rule 12-3-1-a (update):** A potential touchdown, touchback or safety. [Exception: Safety by penalty for fouls that are not specifically reviewable.]

**Case Play 125:** First and goal at the B-5. A22 runs to B's goal line, loses the ball prior to its breaking the plane of the goal line, and the officials rule touchdown. The ball comes to rest in the end zone with no player attempting to recover it.

**RULING (current):** Reviewable play, regarding whether A22 scored a touchdown before he lost the ball. Reverse to no score. A 2-Goal on B-1. If the ball becomes dead in the end zone with no team possessing it, the ball is placed at the spot of the fumble. If the ball is dead in the field of play, the ball is placed at that spot (Rule 12-3-1-a and 12-3-3-d).

**RULING (update):** Reviewable play, regarding whether A22 scored a touchdown before he lost the ball. Reverse to no score. A 2-Goal on B-1. If the ball becomes dead in the end zone with no team possessing it, the ball is placed at the spot of the fumble (Rule 12-3-1-a and 12-3-3-d).

### INTENT:

- [1] There is no need to add a level of complexity.
- [2] The replay official need not be searching for a spot in the field of play where a loose ball becomes dead.

**SOURCE:** Rom Gilbert [1/11/14] ..... (ir125)(14)

---

# **2014 REPLAY CHANGE REQUEST**

## **REPLAY: COACH'S CHALLENGE (12-5-1-b-1)**

---

**RULE NUMBER & PAGE: RULE 12-5-1-b-1, FR-109.**

### **RULE CHANGE:**

**12-5-1-b-1: Change the last two sentences to read, "If a head coach's challenge is successful, he retains the challenge. A coach may have a challenge as long as he has been successful with his previous challenge(s)".**

### **INTENT:**

**The head coach should not lose his challenge when he is successful. The head coach may have had to burn his challenge when:**

- [a] The replay official may not have buzzed based on "direct competitive impact" on the game. However, the play is otherwise reviewable and the coach feels that "direct competitive impact" does apply to his team.**
- [b] There is a problem with the replay equipment.**
- [c] There is a problem with the communications between the replay booth and the field.**
- [d] The replay official may not have buzzed by the time the snap is imminent.**

**When a team loses a game because a coach cannot challenge even though his previous two challenges were successful, this rule change is likely to be implemented. A proactive stance is desirable.**

**Replay statistics have indicated that a coach is successful on a significant percentage of challenges.**

**SOURCE: Rom Gilbert [1-11-14] ..... (1251b1)(14)**

---